

Date: 1 October 2011  
 Opposition: Everton  
 Competition: League

Sunday Times	Times	Guardian	Sunday Mail
Observer	Telegraph	Independent	Mirror
	Echo	Sunday Mirror	Sun Independent



1 October 2011

## THE TIMES

Referee evokes Shankly dictum

Everton 0 Liverpool 2

Carroll 71, Suarez 82

Referee: M Atkinson. Attendance: 39,510

"The trouble with referees," Bill Shankly once said, "is that they know the rules but they do not know the game." At the end of a week which marked the 30th anniversary of the legendary Liverpool manager's death, Martin Atkinson's failure to appreciate that tackling is as much a fixture of the Merseyside derby as rivals clad in red or blue left another Scottish manager with cause to seek solace in a similar refrain. Invoking the spirit of Shankly does not come naturally to an Everton manager, particularly on derby day, but Atkinson's decision to send off Jack Rodwell, the England Under-21 midfielder, for a tackle featuring power, passion and determination - three of the main qualities any player should display on such an occasion - without straying into indiscretion left Moyes with little option but to question whether the referee fully understood the occasion that he was officiating. It could be argued that neither Luis Suarez, the recipient of the tackle who writhed around after the impact, nor Lucas Leiva, who demanded punishment as a result, helped the referee. But Atkinson is employed to interpret such situations and not to allow the occasion to distort his decision-making, and by flourishing a red card he not only presided over an obvious injustice, he also disfigured the game beyond recognition. "I'd have been disappointed if he'd have even given a free kick for it and if he'd have given a yellow card you would have asked, 'What was that for?'" Moyes said. "Three years ago that wouldn't have even been a foul," Phil Neville added, alluding to the steady stream of directives that many fear are in danger of turning football into a non-contact sport.

"The rules of the game have been changed," Kenny Dalglish, the Liverpool manager, said. "I am not talking about the decision in this game because I didn't see it. Contact is less and less than in years gone by and everyone knows that. They might not agree with them but the rules are there." The sadness in all this, of course, was that one of English football's most competitive fixtures became anything but. From the moment that Atkinson flourished his red card in Rodwell's direction after only 24 minutes had elapsed, the game turned into attack versus defence, with the only question being how long it would take Liverpool to make the breakthrough. Tim Howard became the first Everton goalkeeper to save a penalty in a Merseyside league derby when he kept out Dirk Kuyt's spot-kick and Charlie Adam hit the crossbar, but despite their numerical advantage Liverpool only turned their dominance of possession into goals after Dalglish replaced the tiring Adam and the ineffective Stewart Downing with Steven Gerrard and Craig Bellamy. The arrival of the cavalry had the desired effect, with renewed intent and purpose being added to Liverpool's play just as it appeared that they might have been running out of ideas.

By scoring his first league goal of the season with a swipe of his left foot, Andy Carroll effectively ended the contest because by that stage Everton were barely getting out of their own half, such were the damaging effects of being depleted in number on the hottest October day since records began.

Suarez doubled the score after charging down an attempted clearance by Sylvain Distin, the Everton central defender, but Liverpool hardly required the latest demonstration of the Uruguayan's finishing skills given the stranglehold they had taken on the game. Liverpool will not be disappointed by Atkinson's intervention; with local pride and crucial points at stake, they are wholly entitled to take full advantage of any decision that goes their way. But they will realise that the dismissal of Rodwell denied them an opportunity to test the progress that has been made over the past 12 months. On the morning of the game, Jamie Carragher had called on Liverpool to show their local rivals how much they had improved since the two sides previous meeting at Goodison Park, an encounter that Everton won 2-0. "As a team we were struggling back then and that day epitomised everything that was wrong about the club and the team," the defender had admitted. Carragher's challenge to his team-mates was to prove that the replacement of Roy Hodgson with Dalglish and the subsequent recruitment of more than [pounds sterling]100 million-worth of players had turned Liverpool into an altogether different beast from the one that surrendered so meekly 12 months earlier. In the same setting, against the same opponents, it appeared that Liverpool had the laboratory conditions required to gauge their development, but Atkinson's intervention changed all that.

Eleven men playing against ten may still be a test, but it is one that is loaded with imperfection and imbalance and even in victory we are yet to learn whether Liverpool's improvement is as tangible as the reversal of last season's scoreline would suggest.

Ratings EVERTON 4-4-1-1 T Howard 7 T Hibbert 6 P Jagielka 5 S Distin 6 L Baines 6 S Coleman 5 M Fellaini 5 J Rodwell 0 6 L Osman 5 T Cahill 0 5 L Saha 6 Substitutes: R Drenth 5 (for Coleman, 59min), P Neville 5 (for Osman, 69), A Vellios (for Hibbert, 79). Not used: J Mucha, D Bilyaletdinov, D Stracqualursi, R Barkley. Next: Chelsea (a) LIVERPOOL 4-4-2 J M Reina 6 MKelly 7 J Carragher 6 M Skrtel 6 J Enrique 6 D Kuyt 6 Lucas Leiva 0 7 C Adam 5 S Downing 4 A Carroll 5 L Suarez 6 Substitutes: C Bellamy 6 (for Downing, 67), S Gerrard 6 (for Adam, 67), J Henderson (for Lucas, 88). Not used: A Doni, S Coates, J Spearing, J Flanagan. Next: Manchester United (h)

## the guardian

Carroll puts down repayment on faith but Rodwell red attaches strings  
 Everton 0

Liverpool 2

Carroll 71, Suarez 82

The breakthrough in the 216th Merseyside derby should also herald a defining moment in the Liverpool career of Andy Carroll, a point where Kenny Dalglish's irritation at inquests into his pounds 35m investment and Fabio Capello's concern at the player's lifestyle are replaced by focus on his ability. It should do but it will not.

Capello was not the only observer at Goodison Park whose analysis of the centre-forward and Liverpool's victory had strings attached by Martin Atkinson. The official erred so badly in his decision to dismiss Jack Rodwell for a clean challenge on Luis Suarez on 23 minutes that he suspended not only the Everton midfielder but judgment on the Merseyside rivals.

Liverpool were professional and composed in their eventual breaking of 10 tired men, Carroll and Suarez marked their debuts in the fixture decisively and the introduction of Steven Gerrard plus the influential Craig Bellamy underlined Dalglish's claims of strength in depth perfectly. Beyond that the bragging rights could not carry their customary weight.

Carroll was largely subdued by an Everton unit forced on to the defensive following Rodwell's exit yet never lost his purpose or work ethic, only his marker, Leighton Baines, when sweeping in Jose Enrique's cross to open the scoring from close range. The 22-year-old's first league goal of the season, and its timing, may enhance the leaner-looking forward's rapport with the Kop and release some pressure but the process of justifying his manager's steadfast faith has barely begun.

Carroll said: "I had been speaking with Jose and I told him I fancied getting my first of the season here. This is by far the highlight of my time here. Scoring against Everton and beating them at their place is special but I have got to keep it going. The goal is for everyone really, Kenny, the other lads and the fans; everyone who has stood by me. It is a great feeling but it doesn't really matter who scores as long we get the three points. We've got Man United next and I've got to make sure that I keep doing well week in and week out."

For 22 minutes the derby was finely poised. Suarez had sent a weak header straight to Tim Howard and Tim Cahill had forced a save from Pepe Reina as the game opened up early but without its occasional malevolence in the tackle. Rodwell's challenge, or rather Atkinson's interpretation of it, changed everything. Suarez appeared to feign injury and Lucas reacted with outrage to a foul that never occurred but they had no influence on the referee's decision. The red card was out.

David Moyes was beyond anger as he digested defeat. The Everton manager challenged the Football Association and Atkinson to rescind Rodwell's three-match ban without the need of an appeal, although the chief executive, Robert Elstone, told the club's website yesterday: "Following a review of the video evidence we believe the decision to be wrong and we will be contacting the FA requesting that the red card is rescinded."

The only involuntary contact from the FA to Everton will be over the disgraceful scenes in the game's finale when Suarez and Bellamy were pelted with objects thrown from the Gwladys Street end. "You don't get these things overturned," Moyes said. "The FA keep together with the PGMO [Professional Game Match Officials] and you find it very difficult to get them overturned. And really what if it was? The disappointing thing is we wanted to have a go and win the derby. I'm not thinking just now about an appeal because I'd expect the people in power to stand up and say 'We got it wrong'. We don't need to say anything about it. Good people admit their mistakes."

Atkinson correctly awarded a penalty to Liverpool when Phil Jagielka caught Suarez and had visited both clubs last week to conduct their referee's appraisal. Howard, who saved Dirk Kuyt's spot-kick, said: "There were a few things he said he would clamp down on, none of which he did today. I don't know what the deal was bringing the referee for the Merseyside derby to the clubs just three days before a game. It made everyone a bit uneasy."

Man of the match  
 Jose Enrique (Liverpool)

Date: 1 October 2011  
 Opposition: Everton  
 Competition: League

Sunday Times	Times	Guardian	Sunday Mail
Observer	Telegraph	Independent	Mirror
	Echo	Sunday Mirror	Sun Independent



1 October 2011

## The Mail

Carroll does a number; Striker gets off mark as Blues pay for Rodwell's red  
 EVERTON 0 LIVERPOOL 2  
 Carroll (71), Suarez (82)

As the final whistle was blown and the teams prepared to leave the pitch, the roar went up and in unison the ground acclaimed their heroes.

'Everton, Everton, Everton,' they sung, for it was that kind of the day. The statistics will record that Everton lost 2-0 at home to their neighbours Liverpool but that barely tells the story of the match. There was anger and frustration aplenty at Goodison Park but clearly a degree of pride about how their team had competed against richer rivals from across the park.

'Look, the team did everything,' said Everton manager David Moyes, exasperated. 'It was a hard, tough game for us today and it became tougher but the players kept at it. I just thought it ruined the game.' He was referring, of course, to the 23rd-minute dismissal of Jack Rodwell. The fact the game remained competitive for another hour after that was only because of the shift his players put in. For Rodwell was hard done-by yesterday. His sliding tackle was undoubtedly strong, but he never appeared to lose control or come off the ground as he slid in on Luis Suarez. The fact that he won the ball is, these days, irrelevant, for if the referee deems that excessive force is used, a red card must be shown. However, it was bewildering to see how Martin Atkinson had come to that conclusion. The red card was immediately produced. 'I'd have been disappointed if it had been a free-kick,' said Moyes, echoing the views of most.

It was a great shame because a feisty derby had been developing. Goodison was at its most ferocious, in a positive way. Not so later, when missiles were thrown at Liverpool. But the initial stages of the game justified the crowd intensity. In a thrilling 60-second sequence, starting in the eighth minute, Dirk Kuyt managed to out-wit Phil Jagielka and hook the ball in to Luis Suarez, who should have scored with a header. But Everton broke back, with Seamus Coleman crossing for Tim Cahill, whose header was superbly tipped over by Pepe Reina. Sylvain Distin and Louis Saha then both went close for Everton before the turning point arrived.

'It's hypothetical whether we would have won it against eleven,' said Kenny Dalglish, and you couldn't fault his logic. But the game changed at that moment as Cahill was forced to retreat into midfield alongside Marouane Fellaini, although Everton restricted Liverpool to two further chances that half. One was a clumsy penalty, conceded by Jagielka on Suarez and quite brilliantly saved, with a dive to his left, by Tim Howard from Kuyt. The second came on the stroke of half-time, Charlie Adam's strike coming off the bar.

Liverpool, and especially Andy Carroll, did improve after the break. Saha had to clear off the line from the centre forward and then Howard saved from Carroll. Jagielka cleared smartly on 54 minutes, while Kuyt went close on 57 minutes. Yet Everton persevered, with Saha turning neatly and unleashing a ferocious shot from 30 yards on the hour that was just wide. Goodison could almost believe.

'We were very professional and composed,' said Dalglish. When the chance came, on 71 minutes, it owed much to substitute Bellamy's scurrying and pass for Jose Enrique, who pulled the ball back for Carroll to turn it in from close range, his first league goal of the season.

'I don't think his confidence is a problem, I think the media is the problem,' said Dalglish. Every week, he claimed, he is asked to assess the Carroll-Suarez partnership. 'We said when we signed both of them it was a great deal for the club and we don't see any reason to change that opinion or have a weekly bulletin.'

If Everton's defending was poor for the first goal, it was chaotic for the second on 82 minutes. Leighton Baines had robbed Suarez of the ball as he advanced on goal, only to collide with Distin, whose prod returned it to the Uruguayan. He finished from a tight angle from six yards to kill the game.

There were chances for Royston Drenthe and Saha thereafter but the cheekiest moment surely came when Suarez prepared to take a late corner. Initially he flinched, as if hit by an object, which he then waved at the ref. Yet as he did so he saw Kuyt in space and chipped the ball over a defender for his team-mate to shoot and strike the post.

'It wasn't the referee that lost us the game, it was us, because we made a couple of defensive lapses and we did everything we could to try to contain them,' said Moyes. It was a noble thought that few managers in a similar position would have acknowledged.

EVERTON (4-4-2): Howard; Hibbert (Vellios 78min), Jagielka, Distin, Baines; Coleman (Drenthe 59), Fellaini, Rodwell, Osman (Neville 69); Saha, Cahill. Subs (not used): Mucha, Bilyaletdinov, Stracqualursi, Barkley. Booked: Cahill. Sent off: Rodwell (23min).

LIVERPOOL (4-4-2): Reina; Kelly, Carragher, Skrtel, Enrique; Kuyt, Lucas (Henderson 88), Adam, (Gerrard 67) Downing (Bellamy 67); Suarez, Carroll. Subs (not used): Doni, Coates, Spearing, Flanagan. Booked: Lucas.

Referee: M Atkinson.

## The Daily Telegraph

Carroll shows first glimpse of new Kop hero  
 Everton 0  
 Liverpool 2  
 Carroll 71, Suarez 82 Att: 39,510

A towering target man with fitness issues, who enjoys downing pints in between occasional goals, usually in Merseyside derbies. It is fair to say not all the initial comparisons between Andy Carroll and Duncan Ferguson are designed to be complimentary.

For one afternoon, at least, Liverpool's No9 ensured he absorbed one of the more endearing habits associated with a former Goodison hero. If Carroll's critical strike on his derby debut marks the beginning of an era where he is the scourge of Everton as much as Ferguson was of Liverpool in the late Nineties, the favourable scrutiny of the [pounds sterling]35million striker's performances will be accelerated.

Carroll did not exactly terrorise the Everton defence in what became an unjustly uneven derby, but his 71stminute opener promised richer tidings for a player who has struggled to adjust to the microscopic analysis of Anfield life.

The Geordie admitted his goal must be the launch pad for a more consistent return on an inflated transfer fee which, whether Anfield's powerbrokers like it or not, will define Carroll's Merseyside career.

Carroll did not put the price on his own head and he should not be perpetually beaten with it. In fact, it is the credibility and reputation of those who agreed the valuation that is as much at stake as the striker's longevity in a red shirt. That is what makes his first league goal of the season, in a fixture which matters more than most, so important.

Kenny Dalglish, a man more versed in the merits of pleading the Fifth Amendment than an American Founding Father when the questions are deemed tiresome, argued the mounting pressure for goals was more fabrication than reality. The striker himself evidently felt he had responded to a burden of responsibility. 'It's a relief to get my first of the season and be back on the score sheet,' said Carroll. 'This is by far the highlight of my time here, easily. Scoring against Everton and beating them at their place is special but you have got to keep it going. 'I had been speaking with Jose Enrique and I told him that I fancied getting my first of the season here. I thought 'this is the day'.'

Carroll's staunch but charitable backers have merit to their argument that he has suffered because the mid-field service is not what he requires. It may transpire an equally pivotal moment in Carroll's Liverpool career arrived eight minutes before his goal. Captain Steven Gerrard, deprived from providing the midfield dynamics behind the Carroll-Luis Suarez pairing since their arrival last January, made his entrance. The trio have still not started a match together.

For all the millions lavished on rebuilding Liverpool; for all the cavalries of recruits following each managerial appointment; and for all the boardroom upheavals, there is one reassuring certainty at Anfield. When the team are in a rut the attention shifts expectantly towards the captain.

After seeing their side toil against an Everton side wrongly deprived of Jack Rodwell from the 24th minute, the visiting fans dispatched an SOS to the usual source. Their impatient demand was for Gerrard's introduction to provide the impetus Liverpool were lacking despite their extra pair of legs.

Gerrard and Craig Bellamy exposed Everton's weariness and with their arrival Dalglish made the second match-defining decision of the day.

Liverpool found the platform to glide unobstructed towards a victory which should have been inevitable once referee Martin Atkinson wrecked hopes of a fair contest. Atkinson's draconian punishment for a challenge which bore no resemblance to a foul on Suarez, let alone dangerous play, disfigured the game and ensured the gulf between the teams visibly grew in the debilitating heat.

Moyes will seek an apology from the official and last night launched an appeal against the dismissal, but held little hope of a reprieve for Rodwell.

'You don't get things overturned,' he said. 'The FA very much keep together with the PGMO [Professional Game Match Officials] and you find it difficult to get anything overturned. And what if it was? The disappointing thing was we wanted to take the three points. We've not won an important derby. I would expect the people in power to stand up and say 'have we got it wrong?' Good people admit their mistakes and accept it and there's no shame in doing that.

'Some referees have picked up the phone and said, 'I got that way wrong'. You can't hide the fact that the sending off cost us the game.'

The hosts were encouraging before Rodwell's exit, but Liverpool improved and could have added more once Carroll eased frustrations. Suarez doubled the lead eight minutes from time to ensure the first-half regrets of a missed penalty by Dirk Kuyt were extinguished with the bitter memories of last season's Goodison embarrassment.

Date: 1 October 2011  
 Opposition: Everton  
 Competition: League

Sunday Times	Times	Guardian	Sunday Mail
Observer	Telegraph	Independent	Mirror
	Echo	Sunday Mirror	Sun Independent



1 October 2011

## THE INDEPENDENT

### Moyes hopes Atkinson can admit his mistake

Martin Atkinson's report on the 216th Mersey derby will make interesting reading when it arrives at the Football Association's offices sometime today.

Everton will hope for the best that the referee has seen the error of his ways in sending off Jack Rodwell, but will fear for the worst as he is obliged to mention the objects thrown at Liverpool's Craig Bellamy and Luis Suarez as they went to take late corners. By that stage home supporters were boiling over in the record October heat, convinced as their manager David Moyes put it, that Atkinson had "ruined the game" by reducing the underdogs to 10 men for three quarters of the derby. Once over the bitter disappointment of another derby defeat - he has only won three out of 19 - Moyes saw the sense in appealing the red card.

The whole world having now noted that Rodwell's challenge on Suarez in the 23rd minute was legitimate, there can be no question of the FA adding to the current three-man ban on grounds of a frivolous appeal. What Everton do stand to gain is having the decision rescinded and therefore having Rodwell available against Chelsea (in the League and Carling Cup) and Fulham. Since the departure of Mikel Arteta, he has become a vital cog in midfield. Until Saturday he had collected only one yellow card in six matches. On Saturday night, Moyes was still saying: "I would expect the people in power to stand up and say 'have we got it wrong?'. Good people admit their mistakes, hold their hands up and accept it. There's no shame in doing that." His deep sense of hurt led him to add: "You don't get things overturned. The FA very much keep together with the PGMO [Professional Game Match Officials] so you find it very difficult to get anything overturned. And what if it was? The disappointing thing was we wanted to take the three points. We've not won an important derby." He was critical of the decision to appoint Atkinson for a first Everton game since Moyes and his coach Steve Round were fined [pounds sterling]8,000 each for remarks about his handling of the 3-3 draw against Manchester United a year ago, and also of the referee's visit to both training grounds to speak to players and staff last week. Whatever was said was heeded in the opening quarter of the game which was well-behaved and entertaining. Everton, if anything, had the better of it. Moyes was correct, however, in saying the match was spoilt by the sending off. Everton were obliged to withdraw Tim Cahill to deeper position in a 4-4-1 formation, leaving Louis Saha a frustrated man in his first full game of the season. So the home team were unlikely to score from that point and as it turned out, one of Atkinson's better decisions led to Liverpool's opener. He waved play on when Saha fouled Jamie Carragher as they went for one of the regular high balls hoisted towards the striker that became Everton's main ploy; a smooth passing sequence out of defence allowed the lively substitute Bellamy to break down the left with Luis Enrique, whose cross was turned in Andy Carroll. Suarez added the second goal after Sylvain Distin's error. The referee was equally correct to award the penalty from which Tim Howard's fine save offered his team new hope before half-time, and his second worst decision of the day, not penalising Tony Hibbert for a dangerous tackle on Charlie Adam, favoured Everton. But Atkinson's statistics appear to be out of kilter with those of his colleagues, amounting to 15 red cards in 33 League games since the start of last season. The number awarded by a variety of referees in this particular fixture is well above average too but Moyes insisted: "We've got to make sure we don't go down the line of 'another ill-tempered derby' because it was certainly not that." His opposite number Kenny Dalglish was unnecessarily tetchy about the sending off, Carroll's form, the blossoming partnership with Suarez and just about everything else. "We won and everyone is happy," was his summary. He just didn't sound it.

### FEELING BLUE: HOW REFEREES CAUSE EVERTON DERBY DESPAIR

Martin Atkinson is not the first derby referee to earn the enduring wrath of Evertonians:

- \* 1977 Everton 2-2 Liverpool, FA Cup semi-final  
Bryan Hamilton chests home a cross in the last minute but Clive Thomas disallows a goal that was neither handball nor offside. Liverpool win the replay 3-0.
- \* 1984 Everton 0-0 Liverpool, Milk Cup final  
The first all-Merseyside Wembley final ends goalless but only after Alan Hansen handles Adrian Heath's shot on the goalline, an offence unpunished by Alan Robinson. Again, Liverpool win the replay 1-0.
- \* 2000 Everton 0-0 Liverpool, League  
Sander Westerveld's injury-time goal-kick hits Don Hutchison, sending the ball back past the goalkeeper but Graham Poll blows up before it crosses the line. "I was wrong," Poll told Everton's website only last week.
- \* 2007 Everton 1-2 Liverpool, League  
Matchwinner Dirk Kuyt is given only a yellow card for a two-footed leap at Phil Neville while Jamie Carragher escapes an injury-time penalty despite wrestling Joleon Lescott to the ground. Mark Clattenburg has not refereed an Everton game since.

Matchwinner Dirk Kuyt is given only a yellow card for a two-footed leap at Phil Neville while Jamie Carragher escapes an injury-time penalty despite wrestling Joleon Lescott to the ground. Mark Clattenburg has not refereed an Everton game since.

EVERTON 0-2 LIVERPOOL  
 Scorers: Liverpool Carroll 71, Suarez 82. Substitutes: Everton Drenthe 6 (Coleman, 59), Neville 6 (Osman, 69), Vellios (Hibbert, 79). Liverpool: Gerrard 7 (Adam, 67), Bellamy 7 (Downing, 67), Henderson (Lucas, 88). Booked: Everton Cahill. Liverpool Lucas. Sent off: Everton Rodwell (23). Man of the match Kuyt Match rating 7/10. Possession: Everton 41% Liverpool 59%. Attempts on target: Everton 4 Liverpool 9. Referee M Atkinson (W Yorkshire). Att 39,510.



WRONG ATKINSON; Trigger-happy ref's red-card howler ruins Merseyside derby.. and Fa are to blame for handing him the game  
 PREMIER LEAGUE: EVERTON 0 LIVERPOOL 2

THIS was the Merseyside derby that never was.

And maybe, in fairness to those 40,000 supporters who paid 40 quid to watch a contest that never happened, the person - or people - responsible could offer them a refund.

There is surely a case for an enterprising law firm to start a class action on behalf of the fans because this falls into the 'gross negligence' category. The referee Martin Atkinson, who spotted a phantom offence unseen by anyone else, destroyed this match in terms of entertainment.

But the FA are not blameless. What were they thinking of giving this game to Atkinson? An official with the worst record of dismissals in English football and one who struggles to keep players on the pitch.

C'mon guys, this is the Merseyside derby - passions are high, tackles are made. You need a referee whose instinct is to keep 11 against 11 whenever possible. One like Howard Webb, who kept the World Cup Final a spectacle instead of a debacle. As Everton keeper Tim Howard said afterwards, it was impossible for anyone to see a red-card offence in Jack Rodwell's challenge on Luis Suarez - except for hair-trigger Atko.

Howard said: "It was just flatout wrong. You could call many things there - it could have been no foul at all, it could have been a foul, a booking, but you could never have called a red card.

"The referee didn't speak to us after the game but he didn't have to, it was pretty self-explanatory.

I guess it will be shown all over the place tonight, tomorrow, and people will see it for what it is."

The referee was three yards away and still got it wrong. It's not a conspiracy, he doesn't do it on purpose and this is not a witchhunt.

But he ruined the game. Even worse is the possibility he has damaged both Rodwell and Everton. With such a thin squad they will struggle to cover for such a massive young talent for the three games he will be suspended - and he will be, because as Blues boss David Moyes (left) said, the FA will close ranks to cover their official.

Moyes added: "The FA very much keep together with the PGMO [Professional Game Match Officials] and you find it very difficult to get anything overturned." The FA should never have allowed this to happen in the first place, because enough people pointed out beforehand the appointment of Atkinson had disaster written all over it.

They also sent Atkinson to the Everton and Liverpool training grounds days before the game.

According to Howard, a hero for his remarkable penalty save from Dirk Kuyt, it left a sour taste in the mouth.

He said: "I don't know what the deal was bringing the referee to the clubs just three days before a derby. I don't know where that came from, who mandated it. I'm sure they [Liverpool] would have been uneasy about it, we were and it's not the best idea. I certainly don't think he put into practice what he talked about."

The row overshadowed the continuing emergence of Andy Carroll. The Liverpool striker has endured criticism, but his goal - which effectively settled this non-contest because 10 men were never coming back in Saturday lunchtime's heat - could be a landmark moment.

Jose Enrique escaped down the left and Dirk Kuyt allowed the ball to travel to Carroll, who smashed it home.

Carroll said afterwards: "It's a relief to get my first league goal of the season. This is by far the highlight of my time here."

Suarez scored Liverpool's second eight minutes from time when he capitalised on a mix-up between Sylvain Distin and Leighton Baines, giving the scoreline an unbalanced look.

Everton were playing well enough before the injustice to Rodwell to have given us a real contest, not the non-event that followed.

Date: 1 October 2011  
 Opposition: Everton  
 Competition: League

Sunday Times	Times	Guardian	Sunday Mail
Observer	Telegraph	Independent	Mirror
	Echo	Sunday Mirror	Sun Independent



1 October 2011



Reds banish memories of last season's Goodison derby woe  
 IT WAS a cherished victory to help the healing process on both sides of the Atlantic. Liverpool owner John Henry was sat watching 3,000 miles away at home in Boston after being discharged from Massachusetts General Hospital. For Henry, who had injured his neck falling down the stairs on his luxury yacht, a first derby triumph of his Anfield reign was the perfect medicine.

And for those Reds supporters packed into the Bullsens Road on Saturday, this was payback for the chastening experience they had endured here a year earlier. Revenge on the other side of Stanley Park was sweet. Last October Henry was in the Goodison directors' box to see his new £300million investment comprehensively embarrassed. The American must have been tempted to dig out his receipt on a day which laid bare the size of the task in front of Fenway Sports Group. But 12 months on, a revitalised Liverpool showed on Saturday they are now a very different beast. The gap between Merseyside's top clubs has once again widened. And with a fourth win at Goodison in their last five league visits, normal service in this fixture has been resumed.

Of course the Reds received a helping hand. Referee Martin Atkinson's decision to send off Jack Rodwell for his challenge on Luis Suarez midway through the first half was abysmal. It wasn't even a free-kick, let alone deserving of any greater punishment. The appointment of an official who chucks cards around like confetti for such a highly-charged fixture had been widely criticised in the build up and it was Everton who suffered at his hands. Atkinson visited both training grounds last week to speak to players about the latest interpretations of the laws of the game. However, he didn't tell anyone that tackling had been outlawed.

Liverpool have been on the wrong end of plenty of controversial decisions themselves already this season. Refereeing blunders against Sunderland and Stoke cost them points and in the wake of that defeat at the Britannia Stadium, Kenny Dalglish said: "They say it evens itself out over the season so we've got a lot to look forward to." Saturday certainly went some way to addressing the balance. Evertonians will harbour a burning sense of injustice but they should know from bitter experience that a numerical advantage in the derby doesn't always have an impact on the result. Twice in the last five and a half years Liverpool have beaten the Blues despite having a player sent off before the break. In 2006 they won 3-1 after skipper Steven Gerrard got his marching orders inside 20 minutes. Similarly, in February 2010 they were 1-0 victors when Atkinson dismissed Sotirios Kyrgiakos but somehow failed to dish out the same punishment to Marouane Fellaini. On both occasions going a man down only served to galvanise the Reds and the Blues lacked the nous to break them down.

Everton weren't able to pull off a similar trick on Saturday because by dropping so deep after the red card they simply allowed Liverpool to dictate proceedings. It was one-way traffic and the Reds' superior class ultimately told as the hosts wilted in the autumn heat. It had been an even and entertaining contest before Rodwell's early bath but afterwards Everton surrendered both possession and territory. Jamie Carragher says "nothing beats the feeling of winning at Goodison" and he led by example with a heroic display. Alongside him, Martin Kelly could be proud of his efforts as he once again showed he's got the character as well as the talent for the big games. A first clean sheet since August was fitting reward for their efforts. In front of them Lucas Leiva was outstanding in the centre of midfield but for a long time there was a lack of spark in the final third. The passing was too predictable and pedestrian and too often the wrong option was taken. There was a gift when Phil Jagielka clumsily clattered Suarez in the box but Dirk Kuyt couldn't make Everton pay. The Dutchman had scored eight out of eight from the spot for Liverpool but his perfect record was ended by Tim Howard's fine save. Typically, Kuyt battled on unperturbed and more than justified his selection ahead of Jordan Henderson. Only the post denied him a goal at the death.

More urgency and a higher tempo was required to really stretch the Blues and that belatedly arrived when Dalglish rung the changes midway through the second half. A year ago David N'Gog, Ryan Babel and Milan Jovanovic came off the bench at Goodison when Liverpool were in need of inspiration. There was more chance of hell freezing over than any of that trio acting as a game-changer. But as a result of the major rebuilding job Dalglish has overseen courtesy of FSG's backing there's now strength in depth and that was underlined by the entrance of Gerrard and Craig Bellamy. Both provided something Liverpool had previously lacked. Gerrard brought greater composure and the skipper's incisive passing picked holes in a tiring rearward, while Bellamy's pace and direct approach was too much for Tony Hibbert. Within four minutes of their entrance the breakthrough arrived. Bellamy released the impressive Jose Enrique whose cross was cleverly dummed by Kuyt and Andy Carroll wrote his name into derby folklore. The £35million man leapt for joy in front of the Gwladys Street. It was the perfect moment for the big No. 9 to grab his first league goal of the campaign. Carroll had endured a tough afternoon up until that point but he kept fighting and got his reward. Suarez completed a dream day for the derby debutants when he slotted home the second after a defensive mix-up. In the end the margin of victory could have been even greater and the sad sight of bottles and coins being thrown at Suarez and Bellamy failed to dampen the celebrations. Until late February at least, bragging rights belong to the red half of the city.

Back in 1991 Dalglish walked away from a Goodison derby and out of football. Twenty years on his second coming is gathering momentum. One rival has been vanquished but progress must be maintained with a greater threat lying in wait after the international break.



**KENNY'S all smiles, that's andy; Liverpool toil until Carroll hits target**  
**EVERTON 0**  
**LIVERPOOL 2** Carroll 71, Suarez 82  
 KENNY DALGLISH returned to the place where it all got too much for him 20 years ago and went home a winner.

But after 70 minutes of the 216th Merseyside derby he must have wondered whether he should pack it all in again. The Liverpool boss had seen Everton reduced - quite ridiculously - to 10 men when referee Martin Atkinson decided that Jack Rodwell's sliding challenge on Luis Suarez was worthy of a red card. But Dirk Kuyt (below) squandered the chance to break the deadlock when his penalty kick was saved by Tim Howard two minutes before half-time, and the visitors struggled to make their numerical advantage pay.

Andy Carroll looked anything but a pounds 35million striker, there was little invention from wingman Stewart Downing, and midfield pair Charlie Adam and Lucas had been dragged into the kind of slugfest in which David Moyes' men excel.

But then Carroll came up with the kind of finish that prompted Dalglish to smash the Anfield transfer record last January.

Craig Bellamy's introduction three minutes earlier had added fresh impetus to a Liverpool side that was beginning to flag. And when the Welshman freed Jose Enrique down the left, his cross was expertly despatched by Carroll from 12 yards. It was a difficult finish made to look easy by the Kop's No 9. Suarez, that Uruguayan box of tricks, made the game safe eight minutes from the end benefiting from indecision between Leighton Baines and Sylvain Distin.

And suddenly the strain on Dalglish's face evaporated.

This was King Kenny's first return to the Goodison touchline since he famously quit in the aftermath an FA Cup epic tie in 1991 - and he looked younger than he did back then as he paid tribute to his team.

"I don't know whether the sending off changed the game or not," said Dalglish. "But it can sometimes be difficult to play against 10 men. You know what you are going to get with Everton and after the sending off they became even more determined to keep it at 0-0. I think we deserve credit for staying professional and composed. I always knew we would create a chance - but whether we would take it or not was another thing."

"I signed Andy and Luis because it was good business for the club - and I've no reason to change my opinion of them on today's performance."

Not surprisingly, Moyes had a different take on how Rodwell's dismissal changed the course of the contest.

The home team were in the ascendancy when the young midfielder was given the opportunity to show that he had followed his manager's advice to add more bite to his game. Rodwell's challenge on Suarez was tough and uncomf'promising, but he seemed to take the ball cleanly.

Referee Atkinson took a different view from only a few yards away and brandished an instant red card.

A distraught Rodwell had to be guided away from more trouble by Adam, but Moyes said: "It ruined the game."

"People ask about derby matches but that wasn't even a bad tackle. I would have even been disappointed if the referee had awarded a free-kick. They sent the referee to both clubs before the game, but we haven't had him since I was fined a year ago after he had refereed our game against Manchester United.

"The referee didn't cost us the game - defensive lapses did that - but we were having our fair share of the ball before the sending off."

Earlier Pepe Reina had excelled to tip over Tim Cahill's header, before Everton were forced to retreat following Rodwell's dismissal.

But when Kuyt was denied from 12 yards by Howard after Phil Jagielka had rashly lunged into the back of Suarez it seemed as though Dalglish would suffer. In the end, though, he returned to the other side of Stanley Park with three points and a smile.

**MULLOCK'S VERDICT**  
 EVERTON were always up against it once they had been reduced to 10 men, but Liverpool still struggled to make the advantage tell until the closing stages. Once they made the breakthrough and scored it was all over.  
 Killer stat 15 Martin Atkinson has shown 15 Premier League red cards this season, more than any other ref

Date: 1 October 2011  
 Opposition: Everton  
 Competition: League

Sunday Times	Times	Guardian	Sunday Mail
Observer	Telegraph	Independent	Mirror
	Echo	Sunday Mirror	Sun Independent



1 October 2011

**Everton see red over derby defeat**

Red was the colour of the day in the Mersey derby, the visitors running out ultimately comfortable winners after a red card midway through the first half for Everton's Jack Rodwell, a decision that will leave the trigger-happy referee Martin Atkinson's face the same colour as a Liverpool shirt once he watches a replay; the tackle was not worth even a free-kick.

Tim Howard gave his team-mates and the home crowd a boost shortly before half-time by saving Dirk Kuyt's penalty - a decision with which there could be no argument - but Everton, forced to withdraw Tim Cahill to a deeper position, were inevitably on the back foot after having made the early running. In the final 20 minutes Andy Carroll scored his first League goal of the season and Luis Suarez doubled the lead.

Until the fourth sending-off by Atkinson in seven games this season, this was shaping up to be an intriguing, even contest. After it, Liverpool failed to touch any heights, though they appear to be settling into a system that uses the very different talents of Suarez and Carroll, with Stewart Downing and Dirk Kuyt supplying them, to best effect. Kuyt, whose head might have gone down after missing the penalty, was able to leave the pitch with it held high.

Once Rodwell was dismissed, however, the only question realistically was whether Liverpool would score. "I just thought that ruined the day," Everton's manager David Moyes said with justification. "I'd have been disappointed if it was even a free-kick. We were in there competing with Liverpool but the game stopped at that moment."

Kenny Dalglish, returning to Goodison for his first match since retiring 20 years ago in the wake of a fraught FA Cup tie, admitted that the game had been "pretty even at 11 against 11" but praised Kuyt for his reaction and, characteristically, "the team effort".

There had been an early chance each, with Suarez finding no power in a header from Kuyt's cross and Cahill, a minute later, doing much better from Seamus Coleman's centre, Pepe Reina saving well. Shots by Sylvain Distin and Louis Saha were offering Everton further encouragement before the key moment of the whole drama. Rodwell slid in with one foot to win the ball from Suarez, catching him a minor blow on the follow-through, and the snorts of disbelief from old derby warriors like the watching Graeme Souness and Jimmy Case were easy to imagine as Atkinson brandished a straight red card.

It was the 12th in the two clubs' past 16 meetings, but will be rescinded if sense prevails. Fortunately for the officials, there was no dispute about the penalty awarded to Liverpool a minute before the interval, Phil Jagielka's clip of Suarez's legs was so blatant that his hands were raised in self-disgust rather than protest. Kuyt, seeking his 50th League goal, struck his kick right towards the bottom corner but Howard was down splendidly to push it away. The goalkeeper was beaten when Charlie Adam thumped a drive against the bar in the next attack before half-time.

From the start of the second half Liverpool pushed Martin Kelly further forward down the right, and Carroll, quiet hitherto, began winning some headers in dangerous positions. Although Saha and then Howard thwarted him, he was not to be denied. Steven Gerrard came on to add another 25 minutes' work to his recovery programme, but the most influential substitute was Craig Bellamy. In the 71st minute his run and pass sent Jose Enrique down the left to pull back a cross that Carroll swept in with a left-footed shot.

Ten minutes later a second goal materialised, Kuyt finding Suarez, who was dispossessed by Leighton Baines, only for Distin to clear feebly against the Uruguayan, who beat Howard from an angle. Saha then wasted a chance to spark a late revival. Suarez complained of having objects thrown at him near the end before he took a quick corner from which Kuyt hit the post.

"The team did everything and it was us lost the game, not the referee," Moyes said generously. "We made a couple of defensive lapses." With net spending of [pounds sterling]112 million less than Liverpool's since he moved to Goodison, the Everton manager has a thankless task and supporters can hardly be looking for much more than respectability this season or any other until the club is sold to someone with deeper pockets than poor Bill Kenwright.

Everton (4-4-1-1): Howard; Hibbert (Vellios, 78), Jagielka, Distin, Baines; Coleman (Drenthe, 59), Fellaini, Rodwell, Osman (Neville, 69); Cahill; Saha  
 Liverpool (4-4-2): Reina; Kelly, Skrtel, Carragher, Enrique; Kuyt, Adam (Gerrard, 67), Lucas (Henderson, 88), Downing (Bellamy, 67); Suarez, Carroll.

Referee: Martin Atkinson

Man of the match: Kuyt (Liverpool)

Match rating: 7/10

## The Sunday Telegraph

Moyes anger as Rodwell sees red

Everton 0 Liverpool 2

Carroll 71, Suarez 82 Att: 39,510

It was a classic derby tackle: aggressive, hard, taking the ball and then the man. Jack Rodwell stood up, Luis Suarez stayed down but the Goodison crowd's cheers turned swiftly to horror as Martin Atkinson produced the red card. There were just 23 minutes played. It had not even been a foul. Too often managers exploit marginal refereeing decisions to try to protect the poor performance of their team, deflecting criticism of themselves onto the officials. And too often we fall for it. In this instance, however, Atkinson must stick out his chest and accept the criticism: his mistake irredeemably distorted this game.

He was perfectly positioned, so what went through his head? Perhaps the combination of the speed of Rodwell's challenge, the fact that some of his studs were exposed and Suarez's reaction deceived him. Lucas hardly covered himself in glory by running up to Atkinson and aggressively demanding action, but the official's decision had been made by then. "I just thought it ruined the game," Moyes said. "That wasn't down to a bad tackle by a player. We've not had this referee since myself and Steve Round were fined against Manchester United one year ago. I don't know if we can appeal any suspension. I'd have been disappointed with a free-kick -- if he'd given a yellow card I'd have wondered what for." Everton will be able to appeal against the three-match suspension Rodwell's sending off would normally carry and, given the compelling nature of the video replays, will be optimistic of success.

However, from there, with an hour to play, it was going to be brutally hard for Everton to preserve even a draw. They took themselves to the brink of exhaustion trying to maintain their point, with heroic performances from Marouane Fellaini and Tim Cahill in midfield, but Liverpool finally ground them down. Andy Carroll scored his first league goal of the season with just under 20 minutes to go and then Suarez made it safe 11 minutes later. The game had really got started with a thumping Rodwell tackle. Within six minutes he won a 50-50 with Suarez that brought a roar of appreciation round Goodison. He would also execute another excellent tackle, on Carroll, before he was sent off.

Until then there had been some enthusiastic exchanges, not exactly high on quality but fully committed. Phil Jagielka's misjudged clearance allowed Dirk Kuyt to win the ball on the byeline but Suarez could only head his cross straight at home goalkeeper Tim Howard.

Everton responded immediately, rushing up the pitch and Seamus Coleman delivering a fine cross which Tim Cahill met with a typical header. Pepe Reina tipped the ball over the bar.

Moyes was encouraged. Sylvain Distin got hold of the ball after Liverpool had failed fully to clear Leon Osman's cross, turned Jose Enrique brilliantly but could not keep his shot down. Louis Saha then shot wide after some neat build-up work. The way they had started made it that much harder for Moyes and his team to swallow. After the sending off, Everton had to be careful not to lose their heads. Cahill was booked for going in with a high boot on Charlie Adam while Fellaini went in late on Lucas on the edge of the Everton box. Fortunately they did nothing more rash. Kenny Dalglish's side had to be patient. A couple of minutes before the break Adam played a ball to Suarez in the very corner of the Everton area and the Uruguayan spun cannily, drawing Jagielka into a reckless challenge. Dirk Kuyt stepped up to take the penalty but Howard anticipated the Dutchman's effort superbly, plunging low to his left to push it round the post. Adam then connected perfectly with the ball from the left to send it hurtling onto the bar and away to safety. Everton needed to rally at half-time.

After the break the game settled into a pattern, Liverpool trying to create the openings and Everton looking to take an opportunistic chance.

Despite being a man down, Saha had a couple of opportunities to snatch an unlikely lead. The first came after excellent approach play from Fellaini and Cahill, the second when Liverpool's defence inexplicably stood off the Frenchman, allowing him to shoot from 25 yards, his effort going just wide.

To Liverpool's credit, they did not hurry themselves. Carroll had played poorly in the first half but his confidence was lifted by a couple of headers that went close to opening the scoring. When Fellaini went down with cramp, Dalglish prepared to send on Steven Gerrard and Craig Bellamy. Whether or not that was the intention, it must have hit the Everton players' morale.

It was, though, Everton's efforts to grab a winner that undid them, Liverpool catching them on the break to take the lead. Bellamy sped towards the Everton box and sent a weighted pass to the byeline for Jose Enrique. The Liverpool full-back's cross was heading straight for Kuyt but the Dutchman ducked as the ball came to him, giving Carroll the opportunity to convert.

The fatigue told with eight minutes to go. Leighton Baines got back to tackle Suarez in the box but Distin could only clear the ball straight to the Liverpool striker. Suarez beat Howard easily from close range.

A frustrated Baines went surging forward and hit a powerful shot from range but Everton were beaten. Kuyt hit the post from Suarez's stoppage-time corner with a clever flick.

Depressingly, a minority of fans in the Gwladys Street end threw objects at some Liverpool players.

You could understand the sense of raging injustice coursing through the stands but not the actions of those irresponsible few.

Date: 1 October 2011  
 Opposition: Everton  
 Competition: League

Sunday Times	Times	Guardian	Sunday Mail
Observer	Telegraph	Independent	Mirror
	Echo	Sunday Mirror	Sun Independent



1 October 2011

## THE SUNDAY TIMES

### Suarez sinks Everton

THE BALD facts look straightforward.

Two Liverpool goals gave them their ninth victory at Goodison Park this century. As if to emphasise their superiority, they also hit a post, hit the bar and missed a penalty.

Those facts, though, hide the truth, chiefly that the 185th Merseyside league derby pivoted on the 23rd-minute dismissal of Jack Rodwell. Before that, Everton were superior and to fuel their sense of injustice further, even the most redeyed, red-blooded, red-shirted Liverpool fan would struggle to argue that Rodwell's dismissal was justified.

In 1991, when Kenny Dalglish had most recently taken a Liverpool side to Everton, a comedy-of-errors 4-4 draw was the final straw of a reign littered with magnificent glory and unspeakable despair.

Two decades later, on the sunniest of October lunchtimes, the Kop's very own Sun King again led his followers across Stanley Park and to victory after a controversial cornucopia of incident, although Steven Gerrard, returning from his lengthy injury, was fit enough only for a 23-minute cameo and Daniel Agger missed out altogether.

As is their way these days, Everton spent the build-up bemoaning their lack of financial firepower, despite leaving their two most recent outfield signings on the bench. After 90 minutes they had even more cause to grumble.

Against a backdrop more fervent and more partisan than football folklore suggests, the sides introduced themselves to each other with a selection of eye-watering challenges. As the dust cleared, Everton, running powerfully and using the width of the pitch, took control. In the ninth minute, Pepe Reina distinguished himself with a flying save from Tim Cahill's header.

Striker Louis Saha, curiously being given his first start of the season, had too much vim and vigour for Martin Skrtel until he had to lead the line alone. After 23 minutes, Rodwell clearly took the ball from Luis Suarez, whose acrobatic tumble would have impressed Beth Tweedle. To everybody's surprise, well-placed referee Martin Atkinson whipped out a red card almost before the Uruguayan hit the ground. Off went Rodwell, albeit with a certain stunned reluctance. "A sending-off?" asked a stillaghast Everton manager, David Moyes, later. "I'd have been disappointed if it had been a free kick against us. But it wasn't the referee who cost us the game: we had two defensive lapses."

"I didn't see it, so I don't know whether he should have been sent off," shrugged a cagey Dalglish. "But it was pretty even when it was 11 v 11."

Rodwell's exit meant Cahill retreated into midfield and Everton's impetus drifted into the cloudless skies. Shortly before half-time, however, it fleetingly returned. Liverpool, yet to exploit their spare man, were awarded a penalty when Suarez was felled by an impetuous Phil Jagielka challenge, which can't have impressed the watching Fabio Capello.

Dirk Kuyt's penalty was hard and low but Tim Howard dived and pawed it aside. The home support celebrated as if their club was financially secure. Then, in stoppage time, Everton's defence backed off Charlie Adam, whose curler beat Howard, hit the bar and bounced down and out.

The restart brought no respite, but with Lucas Leiva their powerhouse fulcrum, Liverpool began to impose themselves. Jagielka redeemed himself with a spectacular goalline clearance and Howard saved smartly from Andy Carroll's header.

Carroll had hitherto buried his talents but he was about to show his worth. His former Newcastle United teammate Jose Enrique sped to the byline and pulled back. Carroll peeled off Jagielka and shot first-time past Howard.

Already tiring, Everton's resolve and resistance were broken. Kuyt wriggled around Sylvain Distin and Leighton Baines, but lost control. Distin's desperate clearance found only Suarez's midriff and the grateful striker controlled the ball and poked it past Howard.

There was even time for Kuyt to hit the bar after a cute Suarez corner, but that would have been too harsh for Everton to bear.

Everton: Howard 7, Hibbert 6 (Vellios 78min), Jagielka 6, Distin 6, Baines 6, Coleman 7 (Drenthe 59min, 6), Rodwell 6, Fellaini 6, Osman 6 (Neville 69min), Cahill 6, Saha 6 Liverpool: Reina 6, Kelly 6, Carragher 6, Skrtel 7, Jose Enrique 7, Kuyt 7, Lucas 8 (Henderson 88min), Adam 6 (Gerrard 67min), Downing 5 (Bellamy 67min), Carroll 6, Suarez 6

## The Observer

### Old foe Atkinson does the damage after 22 minutes

The Liverpool team coach snaked out of Goodison Road with police vans for an escort and irate Evertonians lining the route to bid it adieu. Luis Suarez, not for the first, and in all likelihood not the last time in his career, was the dominant target for opposition derision.

Inside Goodison Park, David Moyes had identified his own villain, but it was not the Uruguay international, who doubles as a moth to controversy. Martin Atkinson was the sole focus of the Everton manager's anger following the referee's decision to show Jack Rodwell a straight red card for winning the ball with a clean, one-footed challenge that left Suarez writhing on the floor when the midfielder's trailing knee caught the striker's boot. A finely balanced derby had tilted irrevocably towards another exercise in containment for Everton and patience for Liverpool.

Moyes's team were unable to stifle Manchester City last weekend with a full complement of players for 90 minutes, finally bowing to their opponents' greater resources and stronger bench. This time it was Kenny Dalglish's introduction of Craig Bellamy that proved instrumental. The timing of Liverpool's goals, from Andy Carroll on 71 minutes and Suarez with eight remaining, may have been depressingly familiar to Moyes but the two performances otherwise bore no comparison. At the Etihad Stadium, where Rodwell again played a central role with his limpet-like marking of David Silva, Everton were caged by City's dominance and imagination and offered no real threat of their own. There was nothing between the Merseyside rivals until the perfectly positioned Atkinson drew red.

"It ruined the game," said Moyes. A blunt but accurate appraisal. "There are a lot of questions that people ask about derbies, about tackles, about sending-offs and about players but that wasn't down to a bad tackle by a player. I would have been disappointed if it had been a free-kick and if he had given a yellow card you would have said: 'What is that for?'"

"I don't think anyone in this world thought it was a sending-off but it is one of these things that we just have to take that it was wrong and move on."

Moyes had felt uneasy about Atkinson's appointment all week, not only because they have history. In September last year, when Everton salvaged a stoppage-time 3-3 draw with Manchester United courtesy of two injury-time goals, the same referee had blown up prematurely as Phil Jagielka went in search of a remarkable victory. While the rest of Goodison celebrated the comeback, Moyes and his assistant Steve Round confronted Atkinson and berated his time-keeping. The brief stomp cost the pair an pounds 8,000 fine each.

Atkinson and Moyes did not meet again until Tuesday, when the match official arrived at Finch Farm training ground to update Everton's staff on this season's developments and interpretations of the law, a duty he then went on to perform for Liverpool at Melwood. If strong but fair tackles have now been outlawed, Moyes and Rodwell clearly missed the news.

Everton can appeal against Atkinson's decision yet Moyes was unsure if the club would do so. There is unlikely to be such reticence from the Football Association towards the Goodison club after numerous objects were thrown at Suarez in the closing minutes. The Merseyside derby has gained a notorious reputation in recent years and Rodwell was the 20th dismissal in this fixture in the Premier League era, Everton's unlucky 13th. But this can not be portrayed as further evidence of a local spat spiralling out of control or of the underdogs losing composure.

Suarez deservedly won a penalty when clipped by Jagielka and though Tim Howard saved superbly from Dirk Kuyt, Liverpool barely troubled the 10 men until Bellamy's pace and industry told down Everton's right flank. For all the criticism of Atkinson, Moyes did not dispute the outcome.

"The team did everything and I'm so disappointed," he said. "But the referee didn't lose us the game in the end. We made a couple of defensive lapses. It is hard to play Liverpool with 11 men but it became much tougher with 10. At 11 v 11 it wasn't a bad game and we were having our fair share, but the game stopped at that moment."

#### RODWELL'S RED

After 22 minutes, Jack Rodwell made a clean, one-footed challenge on Luis Suarez, but his trailing knee caught the striker, for which the well-placed Martin Atkinson showed a straight red card